



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Commission Government in American Cities



THE ANNALS

VOL. XXXVIII No. 3 NOVEMBER, 1911

EDITOR: EMORY R. JOHNSON

ASSISTANT EDITOR ELLERY C. STOWELL

EDITOR BOOK DEPARTMENT: ROSWELL C. MCCREA

ASSOCIATE EDITORS: THOMAS CONWAY, JR., G. G. HUEBNER, S. S. HUEBNER,
CARL KELSEY, CLYDE L. KING, J. P. LICHTENBERGER, L. S. ROWE.

PHILADELPHIA

AMERICAN ACADEMY OF POLITICAL AND SOCIAL SCIENCE

36TH AND WOODLAND AVENUE

1911

Copyright, 1911, by
THE AMERICAN ACADEMY OF POLITICAL AND SOCIAL SCIENCE
All rights reserved

CONTENTS

PART I

UNDERLYING PRINCIPLES AND TYPICAL PLANS	PAGE
HISTORY AND UNDERLYING PRINCIPLES OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT	3
Ernest S. Bradford, Ph.D., Author of "Commission Government in American Cities"	
COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN THE SOUTH	12
William O. Scroggs, Associate Professor of Economics and History, Louisiana State University	
COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN IOWA: THE DES MOINES PLAN	28
Benjamin F. Shambaugh, Ph.D., Professor of Political Science, State University of Iowa; Superintendent of State Historical Society of Iowa	
COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN KANSAS	49
Frank Greene Bates, Brown University	
COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN THE WEST	56
Ford H. MacGregor, University of Wisconsin	
COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN ILLINOIS CITIES	78
John A. Fairlie, Professor of Political Science, University of Illinois	
THE GRAND JUNCTION PLAN OF CITY GOVERNMENT AND ITS RESULTS	87
James W. Bucklin, LL.B., Chairman, Charter Convention, and City Attorney of Grand Junction	
THE COMMISSION STATUTE OF NEW JERSEY	103
John M. Mathews, Ph.D., Department of Politics and Economics, Princeton University	
ADOPTIONS AND REJECTIONS UNDER THE COMMISSION STATUTE OF NEW JERSEY	108
Joseph A. Dear, Editor of "Jersey Journal"; President of Jersey City Commission Government League	

PART II

PROBLEMS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT

	PAGE
FRANCHISE PROVISIONS IN COMMISSION CHARTERS AND STATUTES	113
Delos F. Wilcox , Author of "Municipal Franchises," and Chief of the Bureau of Franchises of the Public Service Com- mission for the First District, New York	
BUDGET PROVISIONS IN COMMISSION-GOVERNED CITIES.....	128
L. G. Powers , Chief Statistician, Bureau of the Census, Wash- ington, D. C.	
CIVIL SERVICE PROVISIONS IN COMMISSION CHARTERS.....	138
Elliot H. Goodwin , Secretary of The National Civil Service Reform League	
THE SHORT BALLOT AND THE COMMISSION PLAN	146
Richard S. Childs , Secretary of the Short Ballot Organization	
THE INITIATIVE AND REFERENDUM IN COMMISSION CITIES..	153
Charles O. Gardner , Harrison Fellow in Political Science, University of Pennsylvania	
POPULAR CONTROL UNDER THE RECALL	163
H. S. Gilbertson , Assistant Secretary of the Short Ballot Organization	
THE COMMISSION MOVEMENT IN MISSOURI	169
James W. S. Peters , Attorney-at-Law, Kansas City, Mo.	

PART III

**OBJECTIONS, LIMITATIONS AND MODIFICATIONS OF
THE COMMISSION PLAN**

OBJECTIONS TO COMMISSION GOVERNMENT	183
Walter G. Cooper , Atlanta, Ga.	
SOME DEFECTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT	192
Dunbar F. Carpenter , Counsellor-at-Law, Colorado Springs, Colo.	
DEFECTS AND LIMITATIONS OF THE COMMISSION PLAN	201
Charles O. Holly , Attorney and Counsellor-at-Law, Des Moines, Iowa	
MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT ADMINISTERED BY A GENERAL MANAGER—THE STAUNTON PLAN	207
John Crosby , President, Common Council, Staunton, Virginia	

	PAGE
THE LOCKPORT PROPOSAL	214
F. D. Silvernail, Consulting Engineer, Lockport, N. Y.	

PART IV

RESULTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN TYPICAL CITIES

GALVESTON'S COMMISSION PLAN OF CITY GOVERNMENT....	221
E. R. Cheesborough, Galveston, Texas	
RESULTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN HOUSTON, TEXAS	231
Jerome H. Farbar, Director of Publicity, Chamber of Commerce, Houston, Texas	
THE COMMISSION AS IT OPERATES IN AUSTIN, TEXAS.....	236
Hon. A. P. Wooldridge, Mayor and Superintendent of Public Affairs, Austin, Texas	
WHAT GOVERNMENT BY COMMISSION HAS ACCOMPLISHED IN DES MOINES	238
John J. Hamilton, Author of "Government by Commission, or The Dethronement of the City Boss"	
RESULTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN KANSAS CITY, KANSAS	247
Richard J. Higgins, City Attorney, Kansas City, Kansas	
RESULTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN EMPORIA, KANSAS	252
Charles E. Hill, Kansas State Normal School, Emporia, Kansas	
RESULTS OF COMMISSION GOVERNMENT IN HUNTINGTON, WEST VIRGINIA	255
George I. Neal, Attorney-at-Law, Huntington, W. Va.	
BIRMINGHAM, ALABAMA, UNDER THE COMMISSION PLAN....	259
Hon. Walker Percy, Attorney-at-Law, Author of the Birmingham Statute	
BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA, UNDER COMMISSION FORM OF GOVERNMENT	265
William Carey Jones, Professor of Jurisprudence, University of California	

BOOK DEPARTMENT	275
-----------------------	-----

BOOK DEPARTMENT

CONDUCTED BY ROSWELL C. McCREA

Notes, pp. 275-280.

REVIEWS

- COATES—*Tariff Reform, Employment and Imperial Unity*
(p. 280) F. D. Watson
- HALL—*Constitutional Law* (p. 281) J. J. Sullivan
- HARDY AND LINDNOR—*Modern Business*, Vol. VIII (p. 282) R. Riegel
- KELLICOTT—*The Social Direction of Human Evolution* (p. 282) C. Kelsey
- McCALL—*The Business of Congress* (p.283)..... F. W. Coker
- McFARLAND—*A History of the New England Fisheries* (p. 284). W. S. Tower
- REID—*The Laws of Heredity* (p. 285) C. Kelsey
- REINSCH—*Readings on American State Government* (p. 286).... J. A. Fairlie
- SELIGMAN—*The Income Tax* (p. 287) F. L. McVey
- SOLENERGER—*One Thousand Homeless Men* (p. 288) C Kelsey
- SPAIGHT—*War Rights on Land* (p. 289) E. C. Stowell
- SPARGO—*Sidelights on Contemporary Socialism*; MACDONALD—
The Socialist Movement (p. 290) I. B. Cross
- TAYLOR—*The Origin and Growth of the American Constitution*
(p. 291) C. L. Jones
- WEBB—*The History of Trade Unionism* (p. 292) I. B. Cross
- WEBB—*The Prevention of Destitution* (p. 293) C. Kelsey
- WEHBERG—*Capture in War on Land and Sea* (p. 294) E. C. Stowell
- WILCOX—*Municipal Franchises*, Vol. II (p. 295) L. S. Rowe
- WILLOUGHBY—*The Constitutional Law of the United States*
2 vols. (p. 297) C. L. Jones
- WOODRUFF—*City Government by Commission* (p. 298) C. L. King
- WOODRUFF—*Proceedings of the Buffalo Conference for Good City*
Government and the Sixteenth Annual Meeting of the
National Municipal League (p. 299) C. L. King

LIST OF CONTINENTAL AGENTS

FRANCE: L. Larose, Rue Soufflot 22, Paris.

GERMANY: Mayer & Müller, 2 Prinz Louis Ferdinandstrasse, Berlin, N. W.

ITALY: Direzione del Giornale Degli Economisti, via Monte Savello
Palazzo Orsini, Rome.

SPAIN: Liberia Nacional y Extranjera de E. Dossat, antes, E. Capdeville,
9 Plaza de Santa Ana, Madrid.

This volume was planned by Dr. Clyde L. King of the Department of Political Science in the University of Pennsylvania. The papers included were secured and edited by him and the Academy is under special obligation to him.

This work is the fifth of a series of Academy volumes upon Municipal Government. The first volume in the series, entitled "Municipal Problems," published in March, 1904, was followed by another on the same subject in November, 1906. In January, 1906, a volume was devoted to "Municipal Ownership and Municipal Franchises." The fourth book in the series appeared in May, 1908, entitled "Control of Municipal Public Service Corporations." The present volume upon "Commission Government in American Cities" is believed to be a contribution of especial value upon a subject of wide interest and permanent import.

THE EDITOR.

PART ONE

*Underlying Principles and
Typical Plans*

PART TWO

Problems of Commission Government

PART THREE

*Objections, Limitations, and Modifications
of the Commission Plan*

PART FOUR

*Results of Commission Government
in Typical Cities*